

Historic District Commission Minutes

Thursday, February 6, 2020

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Leshar at 6:00 pm in the Meeting Room of the Edgar M. Bosley, Jr. Municipal Building (Town Office), 300 Mill Street. Present were members: Jim Fulton, Glenn Fong, Walda DuPriest and staff Kim Shellem. Member Lesley Potter was not in attendance.

REVIEW OF MINUTES

Member Fulton made a motion to approve the January 2nd minutes as presented. The motion was seconded by Member DuPriest and carried by a vote of 4:0 in favor.

OPENING STATEMENT

Chairman Leshar read the opening statement into the record. He then determined that there was a quorum, he then swore in applicants or members of the public intending to testify.

OLD BUSINESS:

HD-20-681

Richard Beavers
202 Cherry Street

Continued discussion of Windows, door/hardware, baluster, lighting, shutters, parking area

Richard Beavers and Deborah Alms returned with revised site plans and lighting specifications as requested regarding windows, muntins, door/hardware, baluster style, shutter and lighting style. Presented as a discussion item Mr. Beavers noted the changes to sheet A301 1) raise the front porch 2nd floor railing height with a wood railing extension to emulate existing railing in order to meet code compliance and 2) an addition of a porch off the master bedroom with double French doors. Compliance with code and railing height was also discussed.

Mr. Beavers added that the 1st floor porch addition beams have been compromised by the leaking of the 2nd floor decking, he would like to reframe the porch with new decking. Chairman Leshar noted that any repairs with in-kind elements would not require historic district commission review.

The application continued review in a strict standard.

Applicant reviewed details of the proposed materials list with members. Front entry door as shown was discussed a preference of a door with matching sidelights or no sidelights, a 9 lite 2 panel below door-continue to next meeting. Baluster style to remain as original, creating brackets on the first floor to mimic that on the 2nd floor. Clarification on the drawing to show columns on the first-floor porch to be shown going to the floor. Applicant to provide amended drawings. Gutters/downspouts change K style ½ round gutter/downspout. Siding on new addition to match 5” Dutch lap. Proposed lighting- Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 16 Lighting, page 32 of the guidelines noting a preference of option 2. Proposed pavers – concrete. A revised site plan showing a pool was addressed.

There was no public comment.

Merits of the application.

Discussion items: 2nd floor deck over front entrance, addition of balustrade/height and French doors continued to the next meeting.

- Windows - Chairman Leshar made a motion to approve application HD-20-681 as submitted for Jeld Wen windows (no muntin first floor porch wood windows, with muntin (sdl) in the rear windows, 2nd floor windows 6/6 sdl). Motion seconded by Member DuPriest and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 5 Windows, page 16 of the guidelines.

- Door hardware - Chairman Leshar made a motion to **continue the door hardware**. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.
 - Baluster style on the porch – will remain
 - Shutters: Chairman Leshar made a motion to approve wood louvered shutters, hinges and dog pins as submitted. Motion seconded by member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.
- Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 5 Doors and Windows, page 17 of the guidelines.
- Lights – Chairman Leshar made a motion to approve option 2 of lighting as submitted in scale as represented on elevation drawing. Motion seconded by member DuPriest and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 16 Lighting, page 32 of the guidelines.

- Front Entrance – Chairman Leshar made a motion to **continue discussion of the front entrance door (suggesting balanced sidelights 1st floor porch deck area and 2nd story balcony door**. Motion seconded by member DuPriest and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.
- Site Plan – Chairman Leshar made a motion to **continue the discussion of the pavers in the parking** area. Motion seconded by member Fulton and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.
- Site Plan in the pool area- Chairman Leshar made a motion to **continue site plan regarding the pool**. Motion seconded by member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

NEW BUSINESS:

HD-20-682

Oliver & Joan Voss

Replace garage asphalt roof with standing seam metal roof

400 St. Mary's Square

Chairman Leshar noted the property is valued as a "B" on the National Register Map and illustrated in Historic St. Michaels by Elizabeth Hughes, page 101 (T-685 circa 1860 William Tarr house) finding a strict standard of review appropriate. Members concurred.

Applicant is seeking approval to replace asphalt shingles on garage with standing seam metal roof to match existing on main house.

Regarding the ridge cap the proposal states both hand crimped and ridge cap. Chairman Leshar noted the garage is setback from the front of the property and the gable front faces the public way, he then cited Chapter 6 - Roofs, page 18 of the guidelines finding support for a ridge cap or hand crimped seam.

Member Fong made a motion to approve application HD-20-682 as submitted. Motion seconded by Member Fulton and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

HD-20-683

Terye Knopp

Signage

125 Mulberry Street

Contractor Josh Poore representing the applicant proposes to repurpose 3 existing signs (front (2), back (1)) from previous restaurant and install one new sign at front entrance. The three wood oval signs will be covered in vinyl and hung by stainless steel eye hooks affixed to stainless steel clevis.

Chairman Leshar noted the property is valued as an "E" on the National Register Map finding a lenient standard of review appropriate. Members concurred.

Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 8 - Signs, page 21 of the guidelines.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve application HD-20-683 as submitted. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

HD-20-684

Valerie Schumann Renovations
106 E. Chestnut Street

Chairman Leshar noted the property is illustrated in Historic St. Michaels by Elizabeth Hughes, page 93 (T-628 circa 1875 Bell-Baggs house) finding a strict standard of review appropriate. Members concurred.

Architect Lee Weldon and Contractor Josh Cooper presented the application. Two photos were entered into the record as Exhibit #9. Applicant is seeking approval to remodel the exterior. Proposed improvements include: replace wood siding with 6" German Lap siding, demolition of sunroom - replace with covered porch (turned wood columns, synthetic floor), demo rear lean-to replace with new lean-to, add one window to exterior south side, add new bump out. The following is a list of changes to each elevation:

- Front elevation - No changes.
- Right side – Wood German Lap siding (repair & patch), sdl replacement 6/6 wood window
- Left side- replace wood board and batten with 6" German Lap to match original house, wood sdl casement window, new wood window trim to match existing, exterior clad wood French patio door (sdl), Roof - asphalt architectural shingles, open covered porch with composite wood flooring and turned posts, painted wood porch turnings to match existing front porch as closely as possible
- Rear façade-6" German Lap to match original, insulated fiberglass 4 lite/panel rear door, new 6/6, sdl clad exterior wood windows, replace one window with clad exterior sdl 15 light French rear door, lift addition to be 6" German Lap to match original, Fascia/Soffit- painted wood
- Addition of K style gutters to be discussed later.

There was no public comment.

It was noted that the addition of the 1 window on the side elevation is not character changing.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve application HD-20-684 as submitted. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 5, 6, 14 - Windows, Roofs, New Construction and Additions of the guidelines.

HD-20-685

5 Gables Inn Renovations/repairs
204 N. Talbot Street Shutters, Windows, Storm windows, Gutter/Downspouts

Chairman Leshar noted the property is listed in Historic St. Michaels by Elizabeth Hughes and illustrated in Talbot Street Architectural Guidelines, finding a strict standard of review appropriate. Members concurred.

Architect Charles Goebel and applicant Merrin Erkiletian gave a brief presentation of the proposed renovations to 200, 202, 204 N. Talbot Street ("West Property"). Any new exterior finishes will match existing and replacement materials are to be in-kind to existing. Applicant is seeking approval to (1) replace HVAC units with split systems and walls patched using in-kind materials, (2) addition of a window adjacent to the north face of the 2nd floor balcony of 202 N. Talbot (applicant to return with spec sheet regarding the additional window) and (3) squaring off the rear of the building on the 202 N. Talbot

building labeled as “B”, “West Property”(4) a recommendations for improvements to the Milk House concept plan.

Site plans were provided using color coding on historic structures (yellow), addition/alteration to historic structure (green), non-contributing (pink).

Mr. Goebel provided a proposed concept plan for the “Milk Truck Garage” located at 201 N. Fremont Street including materials cut sheet, new materials would be replaced in-kind. This portion of the application would be under a lenient standard of review as previously discussed. Improvements include changes to the entry, add windows, and cupola. Member Fulton stressed compatibility with the existing streetscape. No serious concerns or objections were noted.

Also included an overview of concept plans for the project: Proposed composite shutters are Timberlane Endurian (or equal) louvered mounted on hinges and holdbacks, sized to the openings. Proposed windows are Marvin Signature Ultimate double hung wood w/cladding (preferred) , insulated glass, sdl, 7/8” muntins. Some historic windows remain which are wood/vinyl or aluminum-clad insulated glass replicas. The wood/vinyl windows are true-divided lite with 2/2 muntins pattern. Proposed windows on the addition/alteration and non-contributing structures Marvin Elevate (or equal) Integrity Wood-Ultrex, insulated glass, sdl, 7/8” muntins. Proposed storm windows are Velvalume (or equal) to existing windows. Propose generic ½ round pre-finished gutters and round downspouts as opposed to the existing “K-style” gutters and rectangular downspouts.

Site plans were provided using color coding on historic structures (yellow), addition/alteration to historic structure (green), non-contributing (pink). Discussion of windows: Mr. Goebel clarified that the proposal is to replace the non-historic windows with in-kind replacement (noting that these old windows are replicas having already been replaced and are not original to the structure). He added that if the window is original the plan is to repair or if a replica the option to replace in kind and or upgrade as proposed i.e. gutters, replace existing shutters with functional, sized, positioned correctly to the windows, with shutter dogs and upgrade windows to sdl with 7/8” muntin.

Chairman Leshner request the applicant return with spec sheets on added window and Timberlane (or equivalent) shutters. The discussion of the “Milk Truck Garage”, i.e. additional window and shutters, to be continued to the next meeting. He noted the commission can move ahead with approval of HVAC units/siding repair and window replacement.

Chairman Leshner called for comments regarding composite shutters and specific locations, he could not approve Timberlane shutters to replace historic shutters. However, he could support the Timberline shutters on the non-contributing structure, i.e. “Milk Truck Garage”. Member DuPriest commented that shutters on newer additions of the historic structures visible from the public way should be consistent and that wood is the preferred material. “If shutters are replaced, they are to be replaced with wood shutters correctly sized, mounted, appear to be operable with shutter dogs.”

Member Fulton made a motion to approve application HD-20-685 for the removal of the thru wall HVAC units and repair siding with matching siding material. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

Chairman Leshner cited Chapter 4-Siding of the guidelines.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve the replacement of non-historic windows with wood, sdl windows as per spec sheets which would include upgrades as needed. Motion seconded by member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

Concept plans for the Milk garage and rear additions were supported as discussed, applicant to return with proposed materials and spec sheets for full review.

HD-20-686

Five Gables Inn
209 N. Talbot Street

Renovations/remodel/repairs

Architect Charles Goebel and applicant Merrin Erkiletian gave a brief presentation of the proposed renovations to 209 N. Talbot Street. Modifications to non-historic building to upgrade two building entries, ADA access ramp, interior renovations, general exterior repairs, including where necessary in-kind replacement of deteriorated materials.

Member Fulton noted the property is valued as an “B” on the National Register Map, noted in Historic St. Michaels as the John S. Hambleton House circa 1870 as well as the Talbot Street Guidelines page 65, thus finding a strict standard of review appropriate. Members concurred.

Mr. Goebel noted the color-coded site plans were included. Only 3 original ‘historic’ windows remain at 209 N. Talbot. The sidelights, transom and 3 gable windows are historic all other elements have been replaced. Exhibit #6 of the concept plan proposes a restaurant entry on the right side directly into the dining room and new terrace, exhibit #8 shows side entry thru the parking lot and areal views showing solar panels on the roof (not visible from the public way). Exhibit #9 was introduced and entered into the record, alternate approach showing a door replacing the side window on original portion of building and roof protection. Elements for approval windows, thru 8 wall hvac units on the rear and offer guidance on the concept plan.

Applicant prefers the side entrance which allows an entrance into the vestibule. Chairman Leshar cited additions and new construction of the guidelines. Many of the members preferred the side entrance. Members DuPriest and Fulton preferred either option, keeping in mind to consider preserving the historic structure.

There was no public comment.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve application HD-20-685 for the removal of the thru wall HVAC units and repair siding with matching material. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor. Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 4-Siding of the guidelines.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve the replacement of non-historic windows with wood, sdl windows as per spec sheets (which would include upgrades as needed). Motion seconded by member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

HD-20-687

Nadir Rehman
100 N. Talbot Street

Sign

St. Michaels/Fine Woodworking and Cabinetry
SM St. Michaels Kitchen & Bath
KB Cabinets That Bring Joy

Applicant is seeking approval to install new signage and lighting- flat wall signs and cantilever signs on Talbot Street elevation, 2 flat wall signs on Railroad Street elevation. As there are two businesses on site each sign panel has a wood sign located on the top and an Azek materials on the lower portion of the sign.

Chairman Leshar noted the property is valued as a “E” on the National Register Map finding a lenient standard of review appropriate. Members concurred.

It was suggested the use of MDO (medium density overlay) instead of the composite material. Applicant agreed. Applicant introduced a spec sheet of the proposed gooseneck lighting which was entered into the record as exhibit #5. There was a discussion of the proposed location of signs on the Railroad Avenue elevation.

Member Fulton cited chapter 8-Signs, page 21 of the guidelines.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve application HD-20-687 with the following conditions: sign material to be plywood or MDO and signs facing Railroad Avenue to be located under the primary gable. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

Chairman Leshar cited Chapter 16 - Lighting, page 32 of the guidelines.

Member Fulton made a motion to approve the use of 2-3 gooseneck style lights as proposed on each sign. Motion seconded by Member Fong and carried on a vote of 4:0 in favor.

DISCUSSION:

Leland Weldon-105 Cherry Street Concept plan - Proposed carriage house addition.

Property owner Al Mercier and architect Leland Weldon are seeking concept guidance on proposed plans for a carriage house addition. Members comments include: Stagger the roof ridge at the kitchen 1 ½ story addition, preserve the existing metal crimped seam roofs, in-kind replacement of metal roof is preferred, research the Sanborn Map regarding the original roofing material, preference of no additional dormer, and change the roofing material on the garage.

Leland Weldon - 106 Grace Street Concept plan – Proposed demo, replace front porch & cover.

Property owner Melissa Jones and contractor Bryan Ausley are seeking guidance to demolish existing entry porch including brick piers and expand the porch across the front facade and replace existing steel 6 panel door with new or reclaimed Oxford door. Member Fulton finds the porch addition inconsistent with the streetscape and could not support the request to place a porch on a primary façade on a contributing structure. He added that the primary focus of the commission is preservation. Chairman Leshar said the guidelines do not support the request, he suggested scaling back the covered porch. Members Fong and DuPriest were supportive of the changes.

MATTERS FROM COMMISSION AND STAFF: Chairman Fulton informed the members of a planned meeting with Commissioner Boos and Jean Weisman to discuss the next step of the proposed Guidelines once a final draft is completed.

Placement of applications on the agenda were discussed, Chairman Leshar and staff to discuss.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:15 pm.

Minutes approved as amended by 5:0 vote in favor on 5th day of March 2020.

Pete Leshar, Chairman